Child Advocacy Centers and Sex Trafficking of Children: What are CACs doing? What should CACs be doing?

Why did we do this?

- No valid data about incidence of problem
- Desire to understand what is being done at CACs
- How much of an issue is this at CACs?
- What is being done to respond?
- Are MDTs adequately trained?
- Are professionals adequately trained?
- What types of training are needed?

Questions Being Asked

- No question, the numbers of CST cases we see in CACs is small.

- Is it because:
  - there aren’t many cases?
  - they not being reported and/or recognized?
  - we have not adapted our procedures to meet their needs?

Types of Child Cases Seen at CACs

- Familial Pimping
- Child Pornography Production
  - Obvious
  - Sereptitious
- Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking/Child Sex Trafficking
- Labor Trafficking


Use and misuse of research in books on sex trafficking: Implications for interdisciplinary researchers, practitioners, and advocates, Trauma, Violence, & Abuse, Vol. 16(2), pp. 188-198.

The Truth Shall Prevail

- Purpose - examine research on sex trafficking that is being presented to the general public in books

- Subjects/Design:
  - Author reviewed 42 books on sex trafficking published between 2005 and 2012 – all published at least five years since the passage of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) in 2000.
The Truth Shall Prevail

• Books Reviewed:
  - 27 were academic in style, published by university and academic presses for use in college classrooms and for colleagues in their respective fields of study
  - 15 books were non-academic and were authored by individuals who had a professional or personal interest in sex trafficking
    • 10 were published by less than mainstream publishers
    • 5 were published by more mainstream publishers (Harper and Free Press)

The Truth Shall Prevail

• A total of 33 books (79%) rely on prevalence data from three main “expert” sources
  - U.S. State Department – used in 27 books (64%)
  - Kevin Bales – used in 15 books (36%)
  - Estes and Weiner – used in 12 books (27%)

The Truth Shall Prevail

• U.S. State Department – used in 27 books (64%)
  - 2001 – estimated that 45,000-50,000 individuals in the U.S. were trafficked each year, and as many as 700,000 worldwide
  - 2003 – reduced estimate to 18,000-20,000 victims
  - 2004 – reduced estimate again to 14,500-17,500
  - 2007 – revised worldwide estimate to 800,000
  - Methodology never published - discovered by NE University and the Urban Institute as flawed
  - 2006 – U.S. GAO released a report criticizing these data for “using incongruous methods and unreliable data to project the final estimations.”

The Truth Shall Prevail

• Kevin Bales – used in 15 books (36%)
  - Published Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy (1999)
  - Estimates over 27 million people are living in slavery worldwide
  - In 2012 (third edition) Bales states, “I am the first person to admit this is a rough and flawed estimate of a hidden and poorly defined crime”

The Truth Shall Prevail

• Estes and Weiner – used in 12 books (27%)
  - Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in the U.S., Canada, and Mexico (2001)
  - Suggested 326,000 youth are “at-risk for commercial sexual exploitation”
  - Analysis conducted by the Crimes Against Children Research Center at UNH (Stransky & Finkelhor, 2008) found major methodological flaws in this study

The Truth Shall Prevail

• More than $500 million dollars of federal funding have been expended to fight human trafficking since 2008
• Between 2008 and 2010, only 2,515 human trafficking incidents have been investigated by law enforcement task forces in the U.S.
  - 2,065 were sex trafficking
• Estimate from Northeastern University and the Urban Institute based on all available information on human trafficking in the U.S.
  - 5,166-60,476 victims of human trafficking victims
Overview

- Survey invitation sent to 826 CACs in the United States (three times!!)
  - Early 2015
- 170 respondents from 37 states
  - 20.6% response rate
  - Good geographic representation
  - Largest reporting state – TEXAS (18)

How many counties does your CAC serve?

(48% serve one county)

What is the total, combined estimated population of the counties your CAC serves?

How many cases of DMST/CSEC did your CAC/MDT investigate in 2014?

- 75.9% of CACs saw 5 or less cases
How many children were involved in the cases of DMST/CSEC your MDT investigated in 2014?

If there is a case of DMST/CSEC at your CAC who conducts the Forensic Interview?

Do your forensic interviewers have specialized training in interviewing children/adolescents who have been victims of DMST/CSEC?

Most commonly identified Specialized Forensic Interview Training

- Attendance at conference sessions
- FBI/HSI Training
- State-based FI Training which includes CSEC
- NCMEC Training
- Individual consultation

Pre-Interview Planning

- Necessary & critical part of the Forensic Interview
- Involves three (3) types of information
  - Information about child
  - Information about alleged offense(s)
  - Information important to investigation
- More complex child & case → more need for associated information and planning
  - DISCLOSED vs. DISCOVERED

Forensic Interviewing Modifications

- Rapport Building with street cred
- Barrier Assessment
  - Worries, concerns you have about talking with me?
  - Others worried about your talking with me?
- What is trauma for this population?
  - Younger childhood vs. the life
- Extended Forensic Interview
Forensic Interviewing Modifications

- Differential evidence collection
  - Criminal enterprise overview
  - Recruitment
  - Relationship with pimp
  - Who taught victim the “rules”?
  - Interstate nexus
  - Methods of control
  - Knowledge of others working for pimp
  - Pictures of sex acts taken

Introduction of Evidence

- DISCOVERED cases
- Types:
  - Texts, Emails, Chat logs, Pictorial documentation
- Should be wisely planned and timed
- Protection vs. Trauma to victim?

- Introduction of Evidence Position Paper

Do your medical providers have specialized training in conducting exams with children/adolescents who have been victims of DMST/CSEC?

Most commonly identified Specialized Medical Training

- Limited training
- Many CACs refer to medical providers with more specialized expertise
- Conference workshops

CSEC MD – What might you see?

- Purpose - identify characteristics of CSEC patients vs. CSA victims not related to CSEC when seeking medical care at a large metropolitan hospital

- Subjects:
  - All cases of “suspected CSEC” from 2011-2013 (patients ages 12-18)
  - Control group from same hospital records (patients ages 12-18) with a diagnosis of child sexual abuse between 2010-2013


The NCAC models, promotes, and delivers excellence in child abuse response and prevention through service, education, and leadership.
CSEC MD – What might you see?

- Subjects:
  - CSEC victims – 27
  - CSA victims – 54

- Average Age:
  - CSEC victims – 15.7 years
  - CSA victims – 15.2 years

- Race/Ethnicity:
  - CSEC victims – African-American (56%), White (30%), Non-Hispanic (89%)
  - CSA victims – African-American (53%), White (32%), Non-Hispanic (84%)

CSEC MD – What might you see?

- Significantly more common in the CSEC group:
  - How long the patient had been sexually active
  - Frequency of condom use
  - Prior history of STI
  - Use of contraception other than condoms
  - History of violence by parents/caregivers
  - History of violence with sexual activity
  - Drug/Alcohol use
  - History of running away from home
  - History of Child Protective Services involvement
  - History of Law Enforcement involvement

- 46% of the CSEC victims had seen a medical professional within the past two months

Do your mental health providers have specialized training in conducting exams with children/adolescents who have been victims of DMST/CSEC?

- No - 122
- Yes - 48

Most commonly identified Specialized Mental Health Training

- Evidence-based practices (but not specific to DMST)
  - TF-CBT
  - EMDR

- Conference workshops
- Limited consultation/supervision

Has your MDT received training on how to serve children/adolescents who have been victims of DMST/CSEC?

- No - 92
- Yes - 78

Most commonly identified Specialized DMST Training for MDT

- Conference workshops
- Specialized training
  - Kristi’s House
  - Georgia Center for Children
  - US Attorney’s Offices
  - State Human Task Forces
- State/Local Human Trafficking Task Forces
What is this?

Are you providing any prevention training related to DMST/CSEC in your community?

Prevention Training
- Local training is most common
- Stewards to Children
- OVC
- Traffick911
- NJU Screening Tool for Human Trafficking
- Use of “Chosen” DVD and discussion questions from Shared Hope International
- Human Trafficking Task Forces (state and local)
- The “My Life, My Choice” program (Boston)

Does your primary county of service have a Human Trafficking/CSEC Task Force (separate from the MDT associated with CAC)?

Is the CAC or MDT a member of this Task Force?

Does your State have a State HT/CSEC Task Force?
Are CACs or MDT represented on the State Task Force?

Are there shelters or other facilities that are appropriate for housing children/adolescents where there are concerns about HT/CSEC?

What are the biggest challenges faced by your CAC in serving this population of children/adolescents? (Select all that apply)

What are the biggest challenges faced by your community in serving this population of children/adolescents? (Select all that apply)

How concerned is your community about this issue?

Next Steps

• What can/should be done?
• Is there a role for CACs?
• How much should CJA be investing in this issue?

Resource:

Innovative Ideas

- Discovered, not disclosed™ vs. traditional
  - CAC referral process – respond
- How to be more proactive?
- Who should be proactive?
- Target rich environments?
  - Medical Facilities, CPS and LE data, Detention Facilities, Runaways, etc.

- Resource: